Title

mi estimate - Estimation using multiple imputations

Syntax

Compute MI estimates of coefficients by fitting estimation command to mi data

mi estimate [, options] : estimation_command ...

Compute MI estimates of transformed coefficients by fitting estimation command to mi data

mi estimate [spec] [, options] : estimation_command ...

where *spec* may be one or more terms of the form ([*name*:] *exp*). *exp* is any function of the parameter estimates allowed by nlcom; see [R] nlcom.

options	description
Options	
<u>ni</u> mputations(#)	specify number of imputations to use; default is to use all existing imputations
<pre>imputations(numlist)</pre>	specify which imputations to use
<u>ufmit</u> est	perform unrestricted FMI model test
nosmall	do not apply small-sample adjustment to degrees of freedom
<pre><u>sav</u>ing(miestfile[, replace])</pre>	save individual estimation results to <i>miestfile</i> .ster
Tables	
[no] <u>citab</u> le	suppress/display standard estimation table containing parameter-specific confidence intervals; default is citable
<u>dftab</u> le	display degrees-of-freedom table; dftable implies nocitable
<u>vart</u> able	display variance information about estimates; vartable implies citable
table_options	control table output
display_options	control spacing and display of omitted variables and base and empty cells
Reporting	
<u>l</u> evel(#)	set confidence level; default is level(95)
dots	display dots as estimations performed
<u>noi</u> sily	display any output from <i>estimation_command</i> (and from nlcom if transformations specified)
trace	<pre>trace estimation_command (and nlcom if transformations specified); implies noisily</pre>
nogroup	suppress summary about groups displayed for xt commands
xtme_options	control output from mixed-effects commands

Advanced	
<pre>esample(newvar)</pre>	store estimation sample in variable <i>newvar</i> ; available only in the flong and flongsep styles
errorok	allow estimation even when <i>estimation_command</i> (or nlcom) errors out; such imputations are discarded from the analysis
esampvaryok	allow estimation when estimation sample varies across imputations
cmdok	allow estimation when <i>estimation_command</i> is not one of the officially supported estimation commands
[†] <u>coefl</u> egend	display coefficients' legend instead of coefficient table; implies nocitable and cannot be specified with citable or dftable
[†] <u>nowarn</u> ing	suppress the warning about varying estimation samples
[†] eform_option	display coefficient table in exponentiated form
[†] post	post estimated coefficients and VCE to e(b) and e(V)
[†] noupdate	do not perform mi update; see [MI] noupdate option

[†] coeflegend, nowarning, *eform_option*, post, and noupdate do not appear in the dialog box. You must mi set your data before using mi estimate; see [MI] mi set.

table_options	description
noheader	suppress table header(s)
<u>notab</u> le	suppress table(s)
nocoef	suppress output related to coefficients
nocmdlegend	suppress command legend that appears in the presence of transformed coefficients when nocoef is used
notrcoef	suppress output related to transformed coefficients
nolegend	suppress table legend(s)
nocnsreport	do not display constraints

See [MI] **mi estimate postestimation** for features available after estimation. **mi estimate** is its own estimation command. The postestimation features for **mi estimate** do not include by default the postestimation features for *estimation_command*. To replay results, type **mi estimate** without arguments.

Menu

2

Statistics > Multiple imputation

Description

mi estimate: *estimation_command* runs *estimation_command* on the imputed mi data, and adjusts coefficients and standard errors for the variability between imputations according to the combination rules by Rubin (1987).

Options

Options

- nimputations (#) specifies that the first # imputations be used; # must be $2 \le \# \le M$. The default is to use all imputations, M. Only one of nimputations() or imputations() may be specified.
- imputations(numlist) specifies which imputations to use. The default is to use all of them. numlist must contain at least two numbers. Only one of nimputations() or imputations() may be specified.
- ufmitest specifies that the unrestricted fraction missing information (FMI) model test be used. The default test performed assumes equal fractions of information missing due to nonresponse for all coefficients. This is equivalent to the assumption that the between-imputation and within-imputation variances are proportional. The unrestricted test may be preferable when this assumption is suspect provided the number of imputations is large relative to the number of estimated coefficients.
- nosmall specifies that no small-sample adjustment be made to the degrees of freedom. The smallsample adjustment is made by default to estimation commands that account for small samples. If the command saves residual degrees of freedom in $e(df_r)$, individual tests of coefficients (and transformed coefficients) use the small-sample adjustment of Barnard and Rubin (1999) and the overall model test uses the small-sample adjustment of Reiter (2007). If the command does not save residual degrees of freedom, the large-sample test is used and the nosmall option has no effect.
- saving(miestfile[, replace]) saves estimation results from each model fit in miestfile.ster. The replace suboption specifies to overwrite miestfile.ster if it exists. miestfile.ster can later be used by mi estimate using (see [MI] mi estimate using) to obtain MI estimates of coefficients or of transformed coefficients without refitting the completed-data models. This file is written in the format used by estimates use; see [R] estimates save.

Tables

All table options below may be specified at estimation time or when redisplaying previously estimated results. Table options must be specified as options to mi estimate, not to *estimation_command*.

- citable and nocitable specify whether the standard estimation table containing parameter-specific confidence intervals is displayed. The default is citable. nocitable can be used with vartable to suppress the confidence-interval table.
- dftable displays a table containing parameter-specific degrees of freedom and percentages of increase in standard errors due to nonresponse. dftable implies nocitable.
- vartable displays a table reporting variance information about MI estimates. The table contains estimates of within-imputation variances, between-imputation variances, total variances, relative increases in variance due to nonresponse, fractions of information about parameter estimates missing due to nonresponse, and relative efficiencies for using finite M rather than a hypothetically infinite number of imputations. vartable implies citable.
- table_options control the appearance of all displayed table output:

noheader suppresses all header information from the output. The table output is still displayed.

- notable suppresses all tables from the output. The header information is still displayed.
- nocoef suppresses the display of tables containing coefficient estimates. This option affects the output produced by citable, dftable, and vartable.
- nocmdlegend suppresses the table legend showing the specified command line, *estima-tion_command*, from the output. This legend appears above the tables containing transformed

coefficients (or above the variance-information table if vartable is used) when nocoef is specified.

notrcoef suppresses the display of tables containing estimates of transformed coefficients (if specified). This option affects the output produced by citable, dftable, and vartable.

nolegend suppresses all table legends from the output.

nocnsreport; see [R] estimation options.

display_options: <u>noomit</u>ted, vsquish, <u>noempty</u>cells, <u>base</u>levels, <u>allbase</u>levels; see [R] estimation options.

Reporting

Reporting options must be specified as options to mi estimate and not as options to *estimation_command*.

level(#); see [R] estimation options.

- dots specifies that dots be displayed as estimations are successfully completed. An x is displayed if the *estimation_command* returns an error, if the model fails to converge, or if nlcom fails to estimate one of the transformed coefficients specified in *spec*.
- noisily specifies that any output from *estimation_command* and nlcom, used to obtain the estimates of transformed coefficients if transformations are specified, be displayed.
- trace traces the execution of estimation_command and traces nlcom if transformations are specified.
 trace implies noisily.
- nogroup suppresses the display of group summary information (number of groups, average group size, minimum, and maximum) as well as other command-specific information displayed for xt commands.
- xtme_options: variance, noretable, nofetable, estmetric; see, for example, [XT] xtmixed. These options are relevant only with the mixed-effects commands such as xtmixed, xtmelogit (see [XT] xtmelogit), and xtmepoisson (see [XT] xtmepoisson). The estmetric option is implied when vartable or dftable is used.

Advanced

- esample(*newvar*) creates *newvar* containing e(sample). This option is useful to identify which observations were used in the estimation, especially when the estimation sample varies across imputations (see *Potential problems that can arise when using mi estimate* for details). *newvar* is zero in the original data (m = 0) and in any imputations (m > 0) in which the estimation failed or that were not used in the computation. esample() may be specified only if the data are flong or flongsep; see [MI] mi convert to convert to one of those styles. The variable created will be super varying and therefore must not be registered; see [MI] mi varying for more explanation. The saved estimation sample *newvar* may be used later with mi extract (see [MI] mi extract) to set the estimation sample.
- errorok specifies that estimations that fail be skipped and the combined results be based on the successful individual estimation results. The default is that mi estimate stops if an individual estimation fails. If errorok is specified with saving(), all estimation results, including failed, are saved to a file.
- esampvaryok allows estimation to continue even if the estimation sample varies across imputations. mi estimate stops if the estimation sample varies. If esampvaryok is specified, results from all imputations are used to compute MI estimates and a warning message is displayed at the bottom

4

of the table. Also see the esample() option. See Potential problems that can arise when using mi estimate for more information.

cmdok allows unsupported estimation commands to be used with mi estimate; see [MI] estimation for a list of supported estimation commands. Alternatively, if you want mi estimate to work with your estimation command, add the property mi to the program properties; see [P] program properties.

The following options are available with mi estimate but are not shown in the dialog box:

- coeflegend; see [R] estimation options. coeflegend implies nocitable and cannot be combined with citable or dftable.
- nowarning suppresses the warning message at the bottom of table output that occurs if the estimation sample varies and esampvaryok is specified. See Potential problems that can arise when using mi estimate for details.
- *eform_option*; see [R] *eform_option*. Regardless of the *estimation_command* specified, mi estimate reports results in the coefficient metric under which the combination rules are applied. You may use the appropriate *eform_option* to redisplay results in exponentiated form, if desired. If dftable is also specified, the reported degrees of freedom and percentage increases in standard errors are not adjusted and correspond to the original coefficient metric.
- post requests MI estimates of coefficients and their respective VCEs be posted in the usual way. This allows the use of *estimation_command*-specific postestimation tools with MI estimates. There are issues; see Using the command-specific postestimation tools in [MI] **mi estimate postestimation**. post may be specified at estimation time or when redisplaying previously estimated results.
- noupdate in some cases suppresses the automatic mi update this command might perform; see [MI] noupdate option. This option is seldom used.

Remarks

mi estimate requires that imputations be already formed; see [MI] mi impute. To import existing multiply imputed data, see [MI] mi import.

Remarks are presented under the following headings:

Using mi estimate Example 1: Completed-data logistic analysis Example 2: Completed-data regression analysis Example 3: Completed-data survival analysis Example 4: Estimating transformations Potential problems that can arise when using mi estimate

Using mi estimate

mi estimate estimates model parameters from multiply imputed data and adjusts coefficients and standard errors for the variability between imputations. It runs the specified *estimation_command* on each of the M imputed datasets to obtain the M completed-data estimates of coefficients and their VCEs. It then computes MI estimates of coefficients and standard errors by applying combination rules (Rubin 1987, 77) to the M completed-data estimates. See [MI] **intro substantive** for a discussion of MI analysis and see Methods and formulas for computational details.

To use mi estimate, your data must contain at least two imputations. The basic syntax of mi estimate is

. mi estimate: estimation_command ...

estimation_command is any estimation command from the list of supported estimation commands; see [MI] **estimation**.

If you wish to estimate on survey data, type

6

. mi estimate: svy: estimation_command ...

If you want to vary the number of imputations or select which imputations to use in the computations, use the nimputations() or the imputations() option, respectively.

. mi estimate, nimputations(9): estimation_command ...

Doing so is useful to evaluate the stability of MI results.

You can obtain more-detailed information about imputation results by specifying the dftable and vartable options.

You can additionally obtain estimates of transformed coefficients by specifying expressions with mi estimate; see Example 4: Estimating transformations for details.

When using mi estimate, keep in mind that

- 1. mi estimate is its own estimation command.
- 2. mi estimate uses different degrees of freedom for each estimated parameter when computing its significance level and confidence interval.
- 3. mi estimate reports results in the coefficient metric under which combination rules are applied regardless of the default reporting metric of the specified *estimation_command*. Use *eform_option* with mi estimate to report results in the exponentiated metric, if you wish.
- 4. mi estimate has its own reporting options and does not respect command-specific reporting options. The reporting options specified with *estimation_command* affect only the output of the command that is displayed when mi estimate's noisily option is specified. Specify mi estimate's options immediately after the mi estimate command:

. mi estimate, options: estimation_command ...

Example 1: Completed-data logistic analysis

Recall the logistic analysis of the heart attack data from [MI] **intro substantive**. The goal of the analysis was to explore the relationship between heart attacks and smoking adjusted for other factors such as age, body mass index, gender, and educational status. The original data contain missing values of BMI. The listwise-deletion analysis on the original data determined that smoking and BMI have significant impact on a heart attack. After imputing missing values of BMI, age was determined to be a significant factor as well. See A brief introduction to MI using Stata in [MI] **intro substantive** for details. The data we used are stored in mheart1s20.dta.

Below we refit the logistic model using the imputed data. We also specify the dots option so that dots will be displayed as estimations are completed.

(Continued on next page)

. use http://w (Fictional heat)	www.stata-pres art attack dat	ss.com/data/r ta; bmi missi	11/mhear ng)	t1s20		
. mi estimate	, dots: logit	attack smoke	es age bm	i hsgrad	d female	
Imputations (2	20):					
	20 da	one				
Multiple-imput	tation estimat	tes		Imput	tations =	= 20
Logistic regre	ession			Numbe	er of obs =	= 154
				Avera	age RVI =	= 0.0312
DF adjustment	: Large samp	ple		DF:	min =	= 1060.38
					avg =	= 223362.56
					max =	= 493335.88
Model F test:	Equal H	FMI		F(5,71379.3) =	= 3.59
Within VCE ty	pe: (DIM		Prob	> F =	= 0.0030
attack	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Conf	f. Interval]
smokes	1.198595	.3578195	3.35	0.001	.4972789	1.899911
age	.0360159	.0154399	2.33	0.020	.0057541	.0662776
bmi	.1039416	.0476136	2.18	0.029	.010514	.1973692
hsgrad	.1578992	.4049257	0.39	0.697	6357464	.9515449
female	1067433	.4164735	-0.26	0.798	9230191	.7095326
_cons	-5.478143	1.685075	-3.25	0.001	-8.782394	-2.173892
	1					

The left header column reports information about the fitted MI model. The right header column reports the number of imputations and the number of observations used, the average relative variance increase (RVI) due to nonresponse, a summary about parameter-specific degrees of freedom (DF), and the overall model test that all coefficients, excluding the constant, are equal to zero.

Notice first that mi estimate reports Student's t and F statistics for inference although logit would usually report Z and χ^2 statistics.

mi estimate: logit is not logit. mi estimate uses Rubin's combination rules to obtain the estimates from multiply imputed data. The variability of the MI estimates consists of two components: variability within imputations and variability between imputations. Therefore, the precision of the MI estimates is governed not only by the number of observations in the sample but also by the number of imputations. As such, even if the number of observations is large, if the number of imputations is small, the reference distribution used for inference will deviate from the normal distribution. Because in practice the number of imputations tends to be small, mi estimate uses a reference t distribution.

Returning to the output, average RVI reports the average relative increase (averaged over all coefficients) in variance of the estimates because of the missing bmi values. A relative variance increase is an increase in the variance of the estimate because of the loss of information about the parameter due to nonresponse relative to the variance of the estimate with no information lost. The closer this number is to zero, the less effect missing data have on the variance of the estimate. Note that the reported RVI will be zero if you use mi estimate with the complete data or with missing data that have not been imputed. In our case, average RVI is small: 0.03.

The coefficient-specific degrees of freedom (DF) averaging 223,363 are large. They are large because the MI degrees of freedom depends not only on the number of imputations but also on the RVI due to nonresponse. Specifically, the degrees of freedom is inversely related to RVI. The closer RVI is to zero, the larger the degrees of freedom regardless of the number of imputations.

To the left of the DF, we see that the degrees of freedom are obtained under a large-sample assumption. The alternative is to use a small-sample adjustment. Whether the small-sample adjustment is applied is determined by the type of the reference distribution used for inference by the specified estimation command. For the commands that use a large-sample (normal) approximation for inference, a large-sample approximation is used when computing the MI degrees of freedom. For the commands that

use a small-sample (Student's t) approximation for inference, a small-sample approximation is used when computing the MI degrees of freedom. See *Methods and formulas* for details. As we already mentioned, logit assumes large samples for inference, and thus the MI degrees of freedom is computed assuming a large sample.

The model F test rejects the hypothesis that all coefficients are equal to zero and thus rules out a constant-only model for heart attacks. By default, the model test uses the assumption that the fractions of missing information of all coefficients are equal (as noted by Equal FMI to the left). Although this assumption may not be supported by the data, it is used to circumvent the difficulties arising with the estimation of the between-imputation variance matrix based on a small number of imputations. See *Methods and formulas* and [MI] **mi estimate postestimation** for details.

mi estimate also reports the type of variance estimation used by the estimation command to compute variance estimates in the individual completed-data analysis. These completed-data variance estimates are then used to compute the within-imputation variance. In our example, the observed-information-matrix (OIM) method, the default variance-estimation method used by maximum likelihood estimation, is used to compute completed-data VCEs. This is labeled as Within VCE type: OIM in the output.

Finally, mi estimate reports a coefficient table containing the combined estimates. Unlike all other Stata estimation commands, the reported significance levels and confidence intervals in this table are based on degrees of freedom that is specific to each coefficient. Remember that the degrees of freedom depends on the relative variance increases and thus on how much information is lost about the estimated parameter due to missing data. How much information is lost is specific to each parameter and so is the degrees of freedom.

As we already saw, a summary of the coefficient-specific degrees of freedom (minimum, average, and maximum) was reported in the header. We can obtain a table containing coefficient-specific degrees of freedom by replaying the results with the dftable option:

. mi estimate,	, dftable						
Multiple-imput	tes		Impu	tations	=	20	
Logistic regre	ession			Numb	er of obs	=	154
				Aver	age RVI	=	0.0312
DF adjustment:	Large sam	ple		DF:	min	=	1060.38
					avg	=	223362.56
					max	=	493335.88
Model F test:	Equal 1	FMI		F(5,71379.3)	=	3.59
Within VCE typ	be: (MIC		Prob	> F	=	0.0030
							% Increase
attack	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	DF		% Increase Std. Err.
attack	Coef. 1.198595	Std. Err.	t 3.35	P> t	DF 320019.4	4	% Increase Std. Err. 0.39
attack smokes age	Coef. 1.198595 .0360159	Std. Err. .3578195 .0154399	t 3.35 2.33	P> t 0.001 0.020	DF 320019.4 493335.5	4	% Increase Std. Err. 0.39 0.31
attack smokes age bmi	Coef. 1.198595 .0360159 .1039416	Std. Err. .3578195 .0154399 .0476136	t 3.35 2.33 2.18	P> t 0.001 0.020 0.029	DF 320019.4 493335.9 1060.4	4 9 4	% Increase Std. Err. 0.39 0.31 7.45
attack smokes age bmi hsgrad	Coef. 1.198595 .0360159 .1039416 .1578992	Std. Err. .3578195 .0154399 .0476136 .4049257	t 3.35 2.33 2.18 0.39	P> t 0.001 0.020 0.029 0.697	DF 320019.4 493335.3 1060.4 165126.7	4 9 4 7	% Increase Std. Err. 0.39 0.31 7.45 0.54
attack smokes age bmi hsgrad female	Coef. 1.198595 .0360159 .1039416 .1578992 1067433	Std. Err. .3578195 .0154399 .0476136 .4049257 .4164735	t 3.35 2.33 2.18 0.39 -0.26	<pre>P> t 0.001 0.020 0.029 0.697 0.798</pre>	DF 320019. 493335. 1060. 165126. 358078.	4 9 4 7 3	% Increase Std. Err. 0.39 0.31 7.45 0.54 0.37
attack smokes age bmi hsgrad female _cons	Coef. 1.198595 .0360159 .1039416 .1578992 1067433 -5.478143	Std. Err. .3578195 .0154399 .0476136 .4049257 .4164735 1.685075	t 3.35 2.33 2.18 0.39 -0.26 -3.25	<pre>P> t 0.001 0.020 0.029 0.697 0.798 0.001</pre>	DF 320019.4 493335.9 1060.4 165126.7 358078.3 2554.8	4 9 4 7 3 8	% Increase Std. Err. 0.39 0.31 7.45 0.54 0.37 4.61

Notice that we type mi estimate to replay the results, not logit.

The header information remains the same. In particular, degrees of freedom ranges from 1,060 to 493,336 and averages 223,363. In the table output, the columns for the confidence intervals are replaced with the DF and % Increase Std. Err. columns. We now see that the smallest degrees of freedom corresponds to the coefficient for bmi. We should have anticipated this because bmi is the only variable containing missing values in this example. The largest degrees of freedom is observed

for the coefficient for age, which suggests that the loss of information due to nonresponse is the smallest for the estimation of this coefficient.

The last column displays as percentages the increase in standard errors of the parameters due to nonresponse. We observe a 7% increase in the standard error for the coefficient of bmi and a 4% increase in the standard error for the constant. Increases in standard errors of other coefficients are negligible.

In this example, we displayed a degrees-of-freedom table on replay by specifying the dftable option. We could also obtain this table if we specified this option at estimation time. Alternatively, if desired, we could display both tables by specifying the citable and dftable options together.

We can obtain more detail about imputation results by specifying the vartable option. We specify this option on replay and also use the nocitable option to suppress the default confidence-interval table:

. mi estimate	, vartable no	ocitable				
Multiple-imput		Imputations		= 20		
Variance info	rmation					
	Impı	utation va	riance			Relative
	Within	Between	Total	RVI	FMI	efficiency
smokes	.127048	.00094	.128035	.007765	.007711	.999615
age	.000237	1.4e-06	.000238	.006245	.00621	.99969
bmi	.001964	.000289	.002267	.154545	.135487	.993271
hsgrad	.162206	.001675	.163965	.010843	.010739	.999463
female	.172187	.001203	.17345	.007338	.00729	.999636
_cons	2.5946	.233211	2.83948	.094377	.086953	.995671

The first three columns of the table provide the variance information specific to each parameter. As we already discussed, MI variance contains two sources of variation: within imputation and between imputation. The first two columns provide estimates for the within-imputation and between-imputation variances. The third column is a total variance that is the sum of the two variances plus an adjustment for using a finite number of imputations. The next two columns are individual RVIs and fractions of missing information (FMIs) due to nonresponse. The last column records relative efficiencies for using a finite number of imputations (20 in our example) versus the theoretically optimal infinite number of imputations.

We notice that the coefficient for age has the smallest within-imputation and between-imputation variability is very small relative to the within-imputation variability, which is why age had such a large estimate of the degrees of freedom we observed earlier. Correspondingly, this coefficient has the smallest values for RVI and FMI. As expected, the coefficient for bmi has the highest RVI and FMI.

The reported relative efficiencies are high for all coefficient estimates, with the smallest relative efficiency, again, corresponding to bmi. These estimates, however, are only approximations and thus should not be used exclusively to determine the required number of imputations. See Royston, Carlin, and White (2009) for other ways of determining a suitable number of imputations.

Example 2: Completed-data regression analysis

Recall the data on house resale prices from example 3 of [MI] **mi impute mvn**. We use the imputed data stored in mhouses1993s30.dta to examine the relationship of various predictors on price via linear regression:

10

. use http://www.stata-press.com/data/r11/mhouses1993s30 (Albuquerque Home Prices Feb15-Apr30, 1993) . mi estimate, ni(5): regress price tax sqft age nfeatures ne custom corner Multiple-imputation estimates = 5 Imputations Linear regression Number of obs = 117 Average RVI = 0.2939 Complete DF = 109 min DF adjustment: DF: = 7.51 Small sample = avg 61.46 max _ 94.51 Model F test: Equal FMI F(7, 79.3) =53.00 0.0000 Within VCE type: OLS Prob > F = Std. Err. t P>|t| [95% Conf. Interval] price Coef. .5375429 0.001 tax .1399677 3.84 .2491601 .8259257 .2940729 .0890706 3.30 0.004 .1066042 .4815415 sqft .7605651 -.7325252-0.96 0.365 -2.5063041.041254 age nfeatures 3.696554 13.69565 0.27 0.788 -23.62366 31.01677 8.303979 34.64444 0.24 0.811 -60.47857 77.08653 ne 129.2014 44.29287 2.92 0.004 41.25603 217.1468 custom -1.54 corner -63.77848 41.48302 0.128 -146.174918.61793 135.4265 64.57713 2.10 0.039 7.184164 263.6688 _cons

By default, mi estimate uses all available imputations in the analysis. For the purpose of illustration, we use only the first 5 imputations out of the available 30 by specifying the nimputations(5) option, which we abbreviated as ni(5).

Compared with the output from the previous example, an additional result, Complete DF, is reported. Also notice that the adjustment for the degrees of freedom is now labeled as Small sample. Remember that mi estimate determines what adjustment to use based on the reference distribution used for inference by the specified estimation command.

regress uses a reference t distribution with 117 - 8 = 109 residual degrees of freedom. Thus a small-sample adjustment is used by mi estimate for the MI degrees of freedom.

Complete DF contains the degrees of freedom used for inference in each completed dataset (imputation). It corresponds to the completed-data residual degrees of freedom saved by the command in $e(df_r)$. In most applications, the completed-data residual degrees of freedom will be the same, and so Complete DF will correspond to the *complete degrees of freedom*, the degrees of freedom that would have been used for inference if the data were complete. In the case when the completed-data residual degrees of freedom that residual degrees of freedom varies across imputations (as may happen when the estimation sample varies; see Potential problems that can arise when using mi estimate), Complete DF reports the smallest of them.

In our example, all completed-data residual degrees of freedom are equal, and Complete DF is equal to 109, the completed-data residual degrees of freedom obtained from regress. mi estimate uses the complete degrees of freedom to adjust the MI degrees of freedom for a small sample (Barnard and Rubin 1999).

Example 3: Completed-data survival analysis

Consider survival data on 48 participants in a cancer drug trial. The dataset contains information about participants' ages, treatments received (drug or placebo), times to death measured in months, and a censoring indicator. The data are described in more detail in *Cox regression with censored data*

of [ST] **stcox**. We consider a version of these data containing missing values for age. The imputed data are saved in mdrugtrs25.dta:

```
. use http://www.stata-press.com/data/r11/mdrugtrs25
(Patient Survival in Drug Trial)
. mi describe
 Style:
          mlong
 Obs.:
          complete
                              40
          incomplete
                               8
                                  (M = 25 \text{ imputations})
                              48
          total
 Vars.: imputed: 1; age(8)
          passive: 0
          regular: 3; studytime died drug
          system: 3; _mi_m _mi_id _mi_miss
         (there are no unregistered variables)
```

The dataset contains 25 imputations for 8 missing values of age.

We analyze these data using stcox with mi estimate. These data have not yet been stset, so we use mi stset (see [MI] mi XXXset) to set them and then perform the analysis using mi estimate: stcox:

```
. mi stset studytime, failure(died)
     failure event: died != 0 & died < .
obs. time interval: (0, studytime]
 exit on or before: failure
       48 total obs.
        0
           exclusions
       48 obs. remaining, representing
       31 failures in single record/single failure data
      744 total analysis time at risk, at risk from t =
                                                                 0
                             earliest observed entry t =
                                                                 0
                                  last observed exit t =
                                                                39
. mi estimate, dots: stcox drug age
Imputations (25):
  Multiple-imputation estimates
                                                                            25
                                                  Imputations
                                                                  =
                                                  Number of obs
Cox regression: Breslow method for ties
                                                                  =
                                                                            48
                                                                        0.1059
                                                  Average RVI
                                                                  =
DF adjustment:
                 Large sample
                                                  DF:
                                                          min
                                                                  =
                                                                        998.63
                                                                  =
                                                                      11621.53
                                                          avg
                                                                  =
                                                                      22244.42
                                                          max
Model F test:
                    Equal FMI
                                                  F(
                                                       2, 4448.6) =
                                                                         13.43
                                                  Prob > F
Within VCE type:
                          OIM
                                                                        0.0000
                                                                  =
                    Coef.
                            Std. Err.
                                                P>|t|
                                                          [95% Conf. Interval]
                                           t
          _t
        drug
                -2.204572
                            .4589047
                                        -4.80
                                                0.000
                                                         -3.104057
                                                                     -1.305086
                 .1242711
                             .040261
                                         3.09
                                                0.002
                                                          .0452652
                                                                      .2032771
         age
```

Notice that mi estimate displays the results in the coefficient metric and not in the hazard-ratio metric. By default, mi estimate reports results in the metric under which the combination rules were applied. To obtain the results as hazard ratios, we can use the hr option with mi estimate:

. mi estimate	, hr						
Multiple-imput	Imput	ations	=	25			
Cox regression	n: Breslow met	thod for ties	s	Numbe	r of obs	=	48
-				Avera	ge RVI	=	0.1059
DF adjustment:	: Large samp	ole		DF:	min	=	998.63
					avg	=	11621.53
					max	=	22244.42
Model F test:	Equal 1	MI		F(2, 4448.6)	=	13.43
Within VCE typ	pe: (DIM		Prob	> F	=	0.0000
t	Haz. Ratio	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95% Co	nf.	Interval]
drug	.1102977	.0506161	-4.80	0.000	.044866	8	.2711491
age	1.132323	.0455885	3.09	0.002	1.04630	5	1.225412

We obtain results similar to those from the corresponding example in [ST] stcox.

We specified the hr option above on replay. We can also specify it at estimation time:

. mi estimate, hr: stcox drug age (output omitted)

Notice that the hr option must be specified with mi estimate to obtain hazard ratios. Specifying it with the command itself,

. mi estimate: stcox drug age, hr (output omitted)

will not affect the output from mi estimate but only that of the command, stcox. You see stcox's output only if you specify mi estimate's noisily option.

Example 4: Estimating transformations

Stata estimation commands usually support lincom and nlcom (see [R] **lincom** and [R] **nlcom**) to obtain estimates of the transformed coefficients after estimation by using the delta method. Because MI estimates based on a small number of imputations may not yield a valid VCE, this approach is not generally viable. Also, transformations applied to the combined coefficients are only asymptotically equivalent to the combined transformed coefficients. With a small number of imputations, these two ways of obtaining transformed coefficients can differ significantly.

Thus mi estimate provides its own way of combining transformed coefficients. You need to use mi estimate's method for both linear and nonlinear combinations of coefficients. We are about to demonstrate how using the ratio of coefficients as an example, but what we are about to do would be equally necessary if we wanted to obtain the difference in two coefficients.

For the purpose of illustration, suppose that we want to estimate the ratio of the coefficients, say, age and sqft from example 2. We can do this by typing

(Continued on next page)

. use http://w (Albuquerque H	www.stata-pre Home Prices Fe	ss.com/data/ eb15-Apr30,	r11/mhous 1993)	ses1993s3	0, clear		
. mi estimate > regress pric	(ratio: _b[ag ce tax sqft ag	ge]/_b[sqft]] ge nfeatures): ne custo	om corner			
Multiple-imput	tation estimat	tes		Tmput	ations	=	30
Linear regress	sion			Numbe	r of obs	=	117
2111001 1081001				Avera	σe RVT	=	0 5415
				Compl	ete DF	=	109
DF adjustment	Small samı	nle		DE·	min	=	16 42
Di dajabomente	. Dinarr Danij	910		51.	avo	=	72 83
					may	=	101 18
Model F test.	Equal	FMT		F(7 96	3) =	45 63
Within VCF tw		חוב		Prob	7, 00. >F	=	0.000
price	Coef.	Std. Err.	t	P> t	[95%	Conf.	Interval]
tax	.5516444	.1443319	3.82	0.000	.2612	817	.842007
sqft	.2900879	.0904748	3.21	0.003	.1073	624	.4728134
age	7524605	1.097246	-0.69	0.502	-3.073	675	1.568754
nfeatures	4.361055	13.59917	0.32	0.749	-22.67	719	31.3993
ne	5.495913	34.97562	0.16	0.875	-63.95	148	74.94331
custom	132.3453	43.26507	3.06	0.003	46.52	087	218.1697
corner	-66.95606	40.55801	-1.65	0.102	-147.4	264	13.51429
_cons	130.3491	64.03837	2.04	0.044	3.277	868	257.4203
Tranaformation				Arromo	mo DVT	_	2 0020
Iransiormation	15			Avera	ge KVI	_	2.0039
DE adiustment		.1.		Compi	ete Dr	_	109
DF adjustment:	: Small sam	рте		DF:	min	-	23.04
					avg	=	23.04
within VCE typ	pe:	JLS			max	=	23.04
ratio	: _b[age]/_b[:	sqft]					
price	Coef.	Std. Err	t	P> t	[95%	Conf.	Intervall
ratio	-2.167045	3.460205	-0.63	0.537	-9.324	358	4.990268

We use the nlcom syntax to specify the transformation: (ratio: _b[age]/_b[sqft]) defines the transformation and its name is ratio. All transformations must be specified following mi estimate and before the colon, and must be bound in parentheses.

A separate table containing the estimate of the ratio is displayed following the estimates of coefficients. If desired, we can suppress the table containing the estimates of coefficients by specifying the nocoef option. The header reports the average RVI due to nonresponse and the summaries of the degrees of freedom specific to the estimated transformations. Because we specified only one transformation, the minimum, average, and maximum degrees of freedom are the same. They correspond to the individual degrees of freedom for ratio.

See [MI] mi estimate postestimation for an example of linear transformation.

Potential problems that can arise when using mi estimate

There are two problems that can arise when using mi estimate:

- 1. The estimation sample varies across imputations.
- 2. Different covariates are omitted across the imputations.

mi estimate watches for and issues an error if either of these problems occur. Below we explain how each can arise and what to do about it. If you see one of these messages, be glad that mi estimate mentioned the problem, because otherwise, it might have gone undetected. A varying-estimation sample may result in biased or inefficient estimates. Different covariates being omitted always results in the combined results being biased.

If the first problem arises, mi estimate issues the error "estimation sample varies between m = #and m = #". mi estimate expects that when it runs the estimation command on the first imputation, on the second, and so on, the estimation command will use the same observations in each imputation. mi estimate does not just count, it watches which observations are used.

Perhaps the difference is due to a past mistake, such as not having imputed all the missing values. Perhaps you even corrupted your mi data so that the imputed variable is missing in some imputations and not in others.

Another reason the error can arise is because you specified an if condition based on imputed or passive variables. mi estimate considers this a mistake but, if this is your intent, you can reissue the mi estimate command and include the esampvaryok option.

Finally, it is possible that the varying observations are merely a characteristic of the estimator when combined with the two different imputed datasets. In this case, just as in the previous one, you can reissue mi estimate with the esampvaryok option.

The easy way to diagnose why you got this error is to use mi xeq (see [MI] mi xeq) to run the estimation command separately on the two imputations mentioned in the error message. Alternatively, you can rerun the mi estimate command immediately with the esampvaryok option and with the esample(*varname*) option, which will create in new variable *varname* the e(sample) from each of the individual estimations. If you use the second approach, you must first mi convert your data to flong or flongsep if they are not recorded in that style already; see [MI] mi convert for details.

The second problem we mentioned concerns omitted variables as opposed to omitted observations. mi estimate reports "omitted variables vary" and goes on to mention the two imputations between which the variation was detected.

This can be caused when you include factor variables but did not specify base categories. It was the base categories that differed in the two imputations. That could happen if you specified i.group. By default, Stata chooses to omit the most frequent category. If group were imputed or passive, then the most frequent category could vary between two imputations. The solution is to specify the base category for yourself by typing, for instance, b2.group; see [U] **11.4.3 Factor variables**.

There are other possible causes. Varying omitted variables includes 1) different variables being omitted in the two imputations and 2) includes no variables being omitted in one imputation and, in the other, one or more variables being omitted.

When different variables are being omitted, it is usually caused by collinearity, and one of the variables needs to be dropped from the model. Variables x1 and x2 are collinear; sometimes the estimation command is choosing to omit x1 and other times, x2. The solution is that you choose which to omit by removing it from your model.

If no variables were omitted in one of the imputations, the problem is more difficult to explain. Say that you included i.group in your model, the base category remained the same for the two imputations, but in one of the imputations, no one is observed in group 3, and thus no coefficient for group 3 could be estimated. You choices are to accept that you cannot estimate a group 3 coefficient and combine group 3 with, say, group 4, or to drop all imputations in which there is no one in group 3. If you want to drop imputations 3, 9, and 12, you type mi set m = (3,9,12); see [MI] mi set.

Technical note

As we already mentioned, mi estimate obtains MI estimates by using the combination rules to pool results from the specified command executed separately on each imputation. As such, certain concepts (for example, likelihood function) and most postestimation tools specific to the command may not be applicable to the MI estimates; see *Analysis of multiply imputed data* in [MI] **intro substantive**. MI estimates may not even have a valid variance-covariance matrix associated with them when the number of imputations is smaller than the number of estimated parameters. For these reasons, the system matrices e(b) and e(V) are not set by mi estimate. If desired, you can save the MI estimates and its variance-covariance estimate in e(b) and e(V) by specifying the post option. See [MI] mi estimate postestimation for postestimation tools available after mi estimate.

Saved results

mi estimate saves the following in e():

Scalars

e(df_avg[_Q]_mi)	average degrees of freedom
e(df_c_mi)	complete degrees of freedom (if originally saved by <i>estimation_command</i> in e(df_r))
e(df_max[_Q]_mi)	maximum degrees of freedom
e(df_min[_Q]_mi)	minimum degrees of freedom
e(df_m_mi)	MI model test denominator (residual) degrees of freedom
e(df_r_mi)	MI model test numerator (model) degrees of freedom
e(esampvary_mi)	varying-estimation sample flag (0 or 1)
e(F_mi)	model test F statistic
e(k_exp_mi)	number of expressions (transformed coefficients)
e(M_mi)	number of imputations
e(N_mi)	number of observations (minimum, if varies)
e(N_min_mi)	minimum number of observations
e(N_max_mi)	maximum number of observations
e(N_g_mi)	number of groups
e(g_min_mi)	smallest group size
e(g_avg_mi)	average group size
e(g_max_mi)	largest group size
e(p_mi)	MI model test <i>p</i> -value
e(rvi_avg[_Q]_mi)	average RVI
e(rvi_avg_F_mi)	average RVI associated with the residual degrees of freedom for model test
e(ufmi_mi)	1 if unrestricted FMI model test is performed, 0 if equal FMI model test is performed

16

Macros	
e(mi)	mi
e(cmdline_mi)	command as typed
e(prefix_mi)	mi estimate
e(cmd_mi)	name of estimation_command
e(cmd)	mi estimate (equals e(cmd_mi) when post is used)
e(title_mi)	"Multiple-imputation estimates"
e(wvce_mi)	title used to label within-imputation variance in the table header
e(modeltest_mi)	title used to label the model test in the table header
e(dfadjust_mi)	title used to label the degrees-of-freedom adjustment in the table header
e(expnames_mi)	names of expressions specified in spec
e(exp#_mi)	expressions of the transformed coefficients specified in spec
e(rc_mi)	return codes for each imputation
e(m_mi)	specified imputation numbers
e(m_est_mi)	imputation numbers used in the computation
e(names_vvl_mi)	command-specific e() macro names that contents varied across imputations
e(names_vvm_mi)	command-specific e() matrix names that values varied across imputations (excluding b, V, and Cns)
e(names_vvs_mi)	command-specific e() scalar names that values varied across imputations
Matrices	
e(b)	MI estimates of coefficients (equals e(b_mi), saved only if post is used)
e(V)	variance-covariance matrix (equals e(V_mi), saved only if post is used)
e(Cns)	<pre>constraint matrix (for constrained estimation only; equals e(Cns_mi), saved only if post is used)</pre>
e(N_g_mi)	group counts
e(g_min_mi)	group-size minimums
e(g_avg_mi)	group-size averages
e(g_max_mi)	group-size maximums
e(b[_Q]_mi)	MI estimates of coefficients (or transformed coefficients)
e(V[_Q]_mi)	variance-covariance matrix (total variance)
e(Cns_mi)	constraint matrix (for constrained estimation only)
e(W[_Q]_mi)	within-imputation variance matrix
e(B[_Q]_mi)	between-imputation variance matrix
e(re[_Q]_mi)	parameter-specific relative efficiencies
e(rvi[_Q]_mi)	parameter-specific RVIs
e(fmi[_Q]_mi)	parameter-specific FMIs
e(df[_Q]_mi)	parameter-specific degrees of freedom
e(pise[_Q]_mi)	parameter-specific percentages increase in standard errors
e(<i>vs_names_</i> vs_mi)	values of command-specific e() scalar vs_names that varied across imputations

- vs_names include (but are not restricted to) df_r, N, N_strata, N_psu, N_pop, N_sub, N_postrata, N_stdize, N_subpop, N_over, and converged.
- Results N_g_mi, g_min_mi, g_avg_mi, and g_max_mi are saved for panel-data models only. The results are saved as matrices for mixed-effects models and as scalars for other panel-data models.
- If transformations are specified, the corresponding estimation results are saved with the _Q_mi suffix, as described above.
- Command-specific e() results that remain constant across imputations are also saved. Commandspecific results that vary from imputation to imputation are posted as missing, and their names are saved in the corresponding macros e(names_vvl_mi), e(names_vvm_mi), and e(names_vvs_mi). For some command-specific e() scalars (see vs_names above), their values from each imputation are saved in a corresponding matrix with the _vs_mi suffix.

Methods and formulas

Let **q** define a column vector of parameters of interest. For example, **q** may be a vector of coefficients (or functions of coefficients) from a regression model. Let $\{(\widehat{\mathbf{q}}_i, \widehat{\mathbf{U}}_i) : i = 1, 2, ..., M\}$

be the completed-data estimates of q and the respective variance-covariance estimates from M imputed datasets.

The MI estimate of \mathbf{q} is

$$\overline{\mathbf{q}}_M = \frac{1}{M} \sum_{i=1}^M \widehat{\mathbf{q}}_i$$

The variance–covariance estimate (VCE) of $\overline{\mathbf{q}}_M$ (total variance) is

$$\mathbf{T} = \overline{\mathbf{U}} + (1 + \frac{1}{M})\mathbf{B}$$

where $\overline{\mathbf{U}} = \sum_{i=1}^{M} \widehat{\mathbf{U}}_i / M$ is the within-imputation variance–covariance matrix and $\mathbf{B} = \sum_{i=1}^{M} (\mathbf{q}_i - \overline{\mathbf{q}}_M) (\mathbf{q}_i - \overline{\mathbf{q}}_M)' / (M-1)$ is the between-imputation variance–covariance matrix.

Methods and formulas are presented under the following headings:

Univariate case Multivariate case

Univariate case

Let Q, \overline{Q}_M , B, \overline{U} , and T correspond to the scalar analogues of the above formulas. Univariate inferences are based on the approximation

$$T^{-1/2}(Q - \overline{Q}_M)^2 \sim t_\nu \tag{1}$$

where t_{ν} denotes a Student's t distribution with ν degrees of freedom, which depends on the number of imputations, M, and the increase in variance of estimates due to missing data. Under the large-sample assumption with respect to complete data, the degrees of freedom is

$$\nu_{\text{large}} = (M-1)\left(1+\frac{1}{r}\right)^2 \tag{2}$$

where

$$r = \frac{(1+M^{-1})B}{\overline{U}} \tag{3}$$

is an RVI due to missing data. Under the small-sample assumption, the degrees of freedom is

$$\nu_{\rm small} = \left(\frac{1}{\nu_{\rm large}} + \frac{1}{\hat{\nu}_{\rm obs}}\right)^{-1} \tag{4}$$

where $\hat{\nu}_{obs} = \nu_c(\nu_c + 1)(1 - \gamma)/(\nu_c + 3)$, $\gamma = (1 + 1/M)B/T$, and ν_c are the complete degrees of freedom, the degrees of freedom used for inference when data are complete (Barnard and Rubin 1999).

The sample-sample adjustment (4) is applied to the degrees of freedom ν when the specified command saves the residual degrees of freedom in $e(df_r)$. This number of degrees of freedom is used as the complete degrees of freedom, ν_c , in the computation. (If $e(df_r)$ varies across imputations, the smallest is used in the computation, resulting in conservative inference.) If $e(df_r)$ is not set by the specified command or if the nosmall option is specified, then (2) is used to compute the degrees of freedom, ν_c .

Parameter-specific significance levels, confidence intervals, and degrees of freedom as reported by mi estimate are computed using the formulas above.

The percentage of standard-error increase due to missing data, as reported by mi estimate, dftable, is computed as $\{(T/\overline{U})^{1/2} - 1\} \times 100\%$.

The FMIs due to missing data and relative efficiencies reported by mi estimate, vartable are computed as follows.

The fraction of information about Q missing due to nonresponse is

$$\lambda = \frac{r + 2/(\nu_{\text{large}} + 3)}{r + 1}$$

where the RVI, r, is defined in (3).

The relative (variance) efficiency of using M imputations versus the infinite number of imputations is $RE = (1 + \lambda/M)^{-1}$ (Rubin 1987, 114).

Also see Rubin (1987, 76-77) and Schafer (1997, 109-111) for details.

Multivariate case

The approximation (1) can be generalized to the multivariate case:

$$(\mathbf{q} - \overline{\mathbf{q}}_M)\mathbf{T}^{-1}(\mathbf{q} - \overline{\mathbf{q}}_M)'/k \sim F_{k,\nu}$$
(5)

where $F_{k,\nu}$ denotes an F distribution with $k = \operatorname{rank}(T)$ numerator degrees of freedom and ν denominator degrees of freedom defined as in (2), where the RVI, r, is replaced with the average RVI, r_{ave} :

$$r_{\rm ave} = (1 + 1/M) \operatorname{tr}(\mathbf{B}\overline{\mathbf{U}}^{-1})/k$$

The approximation (5) is inadequate with a small number of imputations because the betweenimputation variance, **B**, cannot be estimated reliably based on small M. Moreover, when M is smaller than the number of estimated parameters, **B** does not have a full rank. As such, the total variance, **T**, may not be a valid variance–covariance matrix for $\overline{\mathbf{q}}_M$.

One solution is to assume that the between-imputation and within-imputation matrices are proportional, that is $B = \overline{\lambda} \times \overline{\mathbf{U}}$ (Rubin 1987, 78). This assumption implies that FMIs of all estimated parameters are equal. Under this assumption, approximation (5) becomes

$$(1+r_{\rm ave})^{-1}(\mathbf{q}-\overline{\mathbf{q}}_M)\overline{\mathbf{U}}^{-1}(\mathbf{q}-\overline{\mathbf{q}}_M)'/k \sim F_{k,\nu_\star}$$
(6)

where $k = \operatorname{rank}(U)$ and ν_{\star} is computed as described in Li, Meng, Raghunathan, and Rubin (1991, 1067).

Also see Rubin (1987, 77–78) and Schafer (1997, 112–114) for details.

19

We refer to (6) as an equal FMI test and to (5) as the unrestricted FMI test. By default, mi estimate uses the approximation (6) for the model test. If the ufmitest option is specified, it uses the approximation (5) for the model test.

Similar to the univariate case, the degrees of freedom ν_* and ν are adjusted for small samples when the command saves the completed-data residual degrees of freedom in $e(df_r)$.

In the small-sample case, the degrees of freedom ν_{\star} is computed as described in Reiter (2007) (in the rare case, when $k(M-1) \leq 4$, $\nu_{\star} = (k+1)\nu_1/2$, where ν_1 is the degrees of freedom from Barnard and Rubin [1999]). In the small-sample case, the degrees of freedom ν is computed as described in Barnard and Rubin (1999) and Marchenko and Reiter (2009).

References

- Barnard, J., and D. B. Rubin. 1999. Small-sample degrees of freedom with multiple imputation. *Biometrika* 86: 948–955.
- Li, K.-H., X.-L. Meng, T. E. Raghunathan, and D. B. Rubin. 1991. Significance levels from repeated *p*-values with multiply-imputed data. *Statistica Sinica* 1: 65–92.
- Marchenko, Y. V., and J. P. Reiter. 2009. Improved degrees of freedom for multivariate significance tests obtained from multiply imputed, small-sample data. *Stata Journal* 9: 388–397.
- Reiter, J. P. 2007. Small-sample degrees of freedom for multi-component significance tests with multiple imputation for missing data. *Biometrika* 94: 502–508.
- Royston, P., J. B. Carlin, and I. R. White. 2009. Multiple imputation of missing values: New features for mim. *Stata Journal* 9: 252–264.

Rubin, D. B. 1987. Multiple Imputation for Nonresponse in Surveys. New York: Wiley.

Schafer, J. L. 1997. Analysis of Incomplete Multivariate Data. Boca Raton, FL: Chapman & Hall/CRC.

Also see

- [MI] mi estimate using Estimation using previously saved estimation results
- [MI] mi estimate postestimation Postestimation tools for mi estimate
- [MI] intro substantive Introduction to multiple-imputation analysis
- [MI] **intro** Introduction to mi
- [MI] Glossary